

Message

---

**From:** Alson, Jeff [alson.jeff@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 1/11/2016 5:11:15 PM  
**To:** Bunker, Byron [bunker.byron@epa.gov]; Cohen, Janet [cohen.janet@epa.gov]; Wehrly, Linc [wehrly.linc@epa.gov]; Birgfeld, Erin [Birgfeld.Erin@epa.gov]; Hengst, Benjamin [Hengst.Benjamin@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** John German's letter re Car and Driver editorial on VW  
**Attachments:** C&D editorial on VW diesel Jan 2016.pdf; ATT00001.htm

Below is a great letter by John in response to the attached editorial in Car and Driver. I recall that John also said some very positive things in the Ann Arbor Observer article on VW a couple of months ago. I found his comparison that the VW cars emitted more NOx than a Mack truck with 67,000 pounds of cargo to be particularly compelling. Erin, we might want to arm our managers with that type of factoid if we haven't already.

John doubts that Car and Driver will print this, but he said he considers his letter to be "public" and it can be shared with others.

---

**From:** John German [mailto:john@theicct.org]  
**Sent:** Sunday, January 10, 2016 7:40 PM  
**To:** Charmley, William <charmley.william@epa.gov>; Alson, Jeff <alson.jeff@epa.gov>; Olechiw, Michael <olechiw.michael@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Joe Schultz <joe@theicct.org>; Anup Bandivadekar <anup@theicct.org>; Peter Mock <peter@theicct.org>; Francisco Posada <francisco@theicct.org>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Eddie Alterman editorial on VW diesel scandal

I doubt Car and Driver will publish my letter, but I thought you might be interested in my response, below, to their editorial in the last edition of Car and Driver (attached).

John

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** John German <john@theicct.org>  
**Subject:** Eddie Alterman editorial on VW diesel scandal  
**Date:** January 10, 2016 7:23:51 PM EST  
**To:** "Editors@caranddriver.com" <Editors@caranddriver.com>  
**Cc:** Joe Schultz <joe@theicct.org>

I have been a Car and Driver subscriber for long enough that the beginning of my subscription is lost in the dim mists of my memory. In all that time I can't recall getting as angry as I did with the ignorance and distortions in Eddie Alterman's editorial on the VW diesel scandal.

"The EPA emissions tests are bitterly divorced from real-world behavior". The EPA tests vehicles at 20 degrees Fahrenheit, 75 degrees Fahrenheit, and 95 degrees Fahrenheit with full sun load and the air conditioning operating. Vehicles are also tested on a highway cycle and on a high speed and high acceleration cycle, with speeds up to 80 mph. What real-world behavior do you think is not included?

"All vehicles, whether diesel- or gas-powered, emit more than these compliance tests measure". This is complete BS. The vast majority of vehicles, both diesel and gasoline, emit

significantly less pollutants than the emission standards allow under almost all real world conditions. Even the BMW X5 diesel tested under contract to the ICCT had emissions below the emission standards during most real world driving. It is only VW - only VW - that cheated on the tests and has high in-use emissions. And even here it is only VW's diesels.

"Let us also not ignore the vastly higher emissions limits for big trucks". Why are you comparing emissions limits instead of emissions? In 2012 West Virginia University ran a 2011 Mack truck loaded to 67,000 pounds across country. Excluding driving through the Rocky Mountains, NOx emissions averaged 0.24 g/mile. The VW Passat diesel tested under contract to ICCT averaged 0.34 g/mile NOx on a freeway route from Los Angeles to Ontario, CA - 40% higher than the Mack truck. The VW Jetta diesel averaged 0.61 g/mile NOx over the same route - well over twice the emissions from the Mack truck.

"It's as if the EPA doesn't want us driving diesel cars". What, because they expect diesels to meet the same emission standard?

"It has been re-demonized. It's likely that this episode could spell the end of diesel cars in the U.S. That's why I'm pissed." I greatly regret that diesel engines are being demonized. There is nothing wrong with diesel technology and diesels are certainly capable of meeting emission standards, while delivering the benefits discussed by Eddie Alterman. But ~~VW~~ absolutely deserves whatever it gets. This is not some minor transgression. The vehicles emit up to 40 times higher emissions than allowed. Worse, VW deliberately cheated and then tried to lie their way out of it when the high emissions came to light. There is no justification for Car and Driver to publish factually incorrect accusations in order to minimize what VW did and to throw the blame on EPA. None. You should be ashamed of yourselves.

John German  
International Council on Clean Transportation  
730 Brooks St.  
Ann Arbor, MI 48103  
734-355-1055